



## Reviewer Comment Checklist

Use this checklist when constructing your reviewer comments to ensure that they are clear, comprehensive, and actionable.

<b>Structuring your comments</b>	
<input type="checkbox"/>	Confidential comment to the Editor (include any comments that you would like to tell the Editor without showing the authors) — Optional
<input type="checkbox"/>	General comments to the authors (state your recommendation here)
<input type="checkbox"/>	Major comments
<input type="checkbox"/>	Minor comments
<b>General</b>	
<input type="checkbox"/>	Start with a brief summary of the paper and your general impressions
<input type="checkbox"/>	State your recommendation <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Accept</li> <li>• Accept upon minor revisions</li> <li>• Accept upon major revisions</li> <li>• Reject (this may include a recommendation to resubmit as a different article type or to submit to a different journal)</li> </ul>
<input type="checkbox"/>	Is the text clearly written?
<input type="checkbox"/>	Does the text fit the aims and scope of the journal?
<input type="checkbox"/>	Is the paper interesting? Does it encourage further research?
<input type="checkbox"/>	Is content presented in the correct location (e.g., results aren't presented in the Discussion section, methods aren't described in the Results section)
<input type="checkbox"/>	Do they have any conflicts of interest that should be considered in the acceptance decision?
<b>Title</b>	
<input type="checkbox"/>	Does it reflect the content of the paper?
<input type="checkbox"/>	Does it include all necessary details (e.g., the study design)?
<b>Abstract</b>	
<input type="checkbox"/>	Does it appropriately summarize the paper?
<input type="checkbox"/>	Does it include important details and main conclusions?
<input type="checkbox"/>	Does it leave out unimportant information?
<b>Introduction</b>	
<input type="checkbox"/>	Does it adequately describe the background to the study?
<input type="checkbox"/>	Does it state the rationale for the study?

<input type="checkbox"/>	Does it identify gaps in the literature to address?
<input type="checkbox"/>	Does it highlight the novel aspect of the study?
<input type="checkbox"/>	Does it state the aim, research question, or hypothesis of the study?
<b>Methods</b>	
<input type="checkbox"/>	Are sufficient details given so that the methods can be reproduced?
<input type="checkbox"/>	Are sufficient details given so that the results can be properly interpreted?
<input type="checkbox"/>	Are statistical methods described appropriately? (Sample size? How was sample size determined? What tests were performed? What was the level of significance? Were tests one- or two-tailed?)
<input type="checkbox"/>	Are the methods used appropriate <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Do the methods follow best practices?</li> <li>• Do the methods produce data/results suitable for addressing the research aims?</li> <li>• Are any methods flawed or misapplied?</li> </ul>
<b>Results</b>	
<input type="checkbox"/>	Are the results presented clearly and logically?
<input type="checkbox"/>	Do all the results correspond to the methods (e.g., are there any results where it is not clear what method was used to obtain them?)
<input type="checkbox"/>	Are the figures and tables clear and appropriate?
<input type="checkbox"/>	Are the amount and nature of the data appropriate?
<input type="checkbox"/>	Are statistical results presented appropriately?
<b>Discussion</b>	
<input type="checkbox"/>	Do they give a good overall summary of their main findings (but not simply repeating results)?
<input type="checkbox"/>	Do they discuss their results with respect to the literature?
<input type="checkbox"/>	Are the cited studies in the discussion appropriate?
<input type="checkbox"/>	Do the results appropriately support the discussion and conclusions?
<input type="checkbox"/>	Do they discuss strengths and limitations of their work?
<input type="checkbox"/>	Do they discuss areas for future research?
<input type="checkbox"/>	Do they state clearly whether they met their research aim, answered their research question, or proved/disproved their research hypothesis?
<b>References</b>	
<input type="checkbox"/>	Are they missing any key studies?
<input type="checkbox"/>	Are all the references cited in the text?
<input type="checkbox"/>	Are the references up to date? (It is fine to cite older studies when needed, but they should also not overlook relevant recent work.)
<input type="checkbox"/>	Are the references balanced, or do they give a skewed view of the literature?